Visible and Invisible Trends in Racialized and Gendered Structural Violence and Black Health

Keon L. Gilbert, Dr. PH, M.A., M.P.A.
Saint Louis University
Associate Professor, College for Public Health and Social Justice
Co-Director, Institute For Healing Justice and Equity
Email: keon.gilbert@slu.edu
Twitter: DrKLG4Health
Presentation Overview

To demonstrate and document:

- Context of violence and criminalization of Black people in the U.S.
- Understand visible and invisible trends of racialized and gendered police violence
- Describe the health effects of structural violence
- Models to move research towards anti-racist interventions
Origins of Modern Policing: 1619 and beyond

- A move from informal citizen patrols to uniformed officers to maintain order of growing populations, paid personnel, and accountability to a government authority
- Formal police control to maintain social control resulting from real or perceived increases in crime, riots, and controlling dangerous groups
- Changes in society such as income inequality, increases in population, labor market changes/economic development
- Late 1600s saw revolts and other forms of resistance from those enslaved continuing into the 1700s, giving rise to Slave Patrols guided by Slave Codes, later Black Codes after 1865
- Communities were encouraged to enforce capturing those who ran away (and fined if they didn’t) to maintain order, culture, and protect economic stability
Victims of lynching by race, 1883-1941

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>4,027 (90.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>99 (2.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>341 (7.6)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>3,265 (73.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>1,082 (24.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>120 (2.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4,467</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Victims of lynching by race, 1883-1941


For 2009 - 2018, there were 2,996,774 violent crime incidents, and 3,417,373 offenses reported by the United States by at most 7,610 law enforcement agencies that submitted incident-based (NIBRS) data.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Offender Race</th>
<th>Victim Race</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black or African American</td>
<td>White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,696,720</td>
<td>2,135,991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American</td>
<td>Black or African American</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,646,918</td>
<td>1,198,787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,646,918</td>
<td>103,459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Asian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>257,901</td>
<td>43,906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian or Alaska</td>
<td>American Indian or Alaska</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32,896</td>
<td>29,943</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alaska Native</td>
<td>Native</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25,226</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>Native Hawaiian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian</td>
<td>Victims w/ reported race</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>3,512,086</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offenders w/ reported race</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3,659,661</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Modern Policing and Structural Violence in the U.S.

- Protect wealthy neighborhoods
- Physically relegate Black residents to Black neighborhoods
- Protect the notion of White supremacy
- Racial profiling
- Groups with higher odds of being killed by police
  - Black men: 2.5x Black women 1.4x
  - American Indian men 1.2-1.7x American Indian women 1.1-2.1x
  - Latino men 1.3-1.4x
- Risk of being killed by police is structured by race, gender, age, place

Racialized and Gendered Trends in Structural Violence
Race, Law and Health: Examination of ‘Stand Your Ground’ and defendant convictions in Florida

Tampa Bay Times Stand Your Ground (SYG) database (n=204 cases) was supplemented with available online court documents and/or news reports (2005-2013).

- Identify patterns of racial bias in the justice system that may exacerbate racial disparities in the form of higher rates of “justified” violent acts towards non-Whites

- Outcome of interest: conviction. We develop logistic regression models using significant bivariate predictors included
  - Race of the victim (White, non-White),
  - If the defendant could have retreated from the situation,
  - If the defendant pursued the victim,
  - If the victim was unarmed, and
  - Who initiated the confrontation


Who was the initiator of the confrontation
Racialized Violence by Law

- Blacks were 84% of victims in SYG database
- Race of the victim was a significant predictor of case outcome in this data set.
- After controlling for other variables, the defendant is 2x (OR 2.1, 95% CI [1.07, 4.10]) more likely to be convicted in a case that involves White victims compared to those involving non-White victims.
- Study demonstrates institutional (legal action to pursue, convict and justifies death) and personally-mediated racism (White fear) in effect in the application of SYG defense
What Happens When You Are Over-policed?

- Aggressive policing elicits “surveillance stress”
- Police contact has long been considered an unpleasant, stressful life event
- Emits deleterious physical and emotional consequences
- Police surveillance, through its links to mass incarceration, exerts social control over ethno-racial- and low resourced communities
- Lethal policing fosters shared experiences of illness among neighborhood residents.
- Race and gender patterns marginalization and criminalization systems differently for men and women across all neighborhoods
Lethal Intervention Death (LID) and Illness Spillover Study

- Created a multilevel database that merging individual-level data from a community survey with neighborhood-level data from multiple sources describing features of NYC (2003-2012)
- 4 unique neighborhoods that are proprietary to the United Hospital Fund (NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene)
- LID: A measure that identifies if someone lives in a neighborhood where at least 3 legal intervention deaths have been documented between 2003 and 2012.
- Multilevel models allowed comparisons of reports of 5 illness conditions for people living in neighborhoods with a high count of LIDs to the illness conditions of those living in neighborhoods where LIDs are rarer

Does living in a lethally surveilled neighborhood impair your health?

- Living in lethally surveilled areas is linked to a greater risk of high blood pressure and obesity for all neighborhood residents and to a greater risk of obesity for women.
- Women face a 30–54% greater risk of diabetes, high blood pressure, and obesity compared to men.
- Lethal killings affect women and men differently.
Fatal Interactions with Police (FIPS) Study

- FIPS database includes details about 1,700 fatal interactions with police that occurred in jurisdictions across the United States during a 20-month time period from May 2013 to January 2015 from Fatal Encounters (FE) and Killed by Police (KBP) databases.

- The FIPS research project includes contributions from public health and biostatistics experts at hospitals and universities, including Washington University in St. Louis, Saint Louis University, New York University and Harvard University.
Fatal Interactions Study Results

- Income inequality within the areas in which a FIP occurred is related to increased relative odds that males of color, and Hispanic males more specifically, will be killed by police.
- Low levels of racial segregation appeared to dramatically reduce the odds of a FIP for Black males while higher levels of segregation increased the odds for Hispanic males.
- Neighborhood factors increase the odds an unarmed Black male being killed by police increases to 6.22 (p<.05)
- Unarmed black males being killed by police decreased when law enforcement agencies had non white officers 1.71 (p<.01), Hispanic males were over 2.6 times as likely as others to be killed by officers from agencies with relatively higher percentages of Hispanic officers.
Intergenerational Study of Economic Opportunity Comparing Black and White Boys

- Black boys have lower earnings than white boys in 99% of Census tracts in America, controlling for parental income.
- Both Black and White boys have better outcomes in “good” (e.g., low-poverty, higher rent) neighborhoods, but the Black-White gap is bigger in such areas.
- Within low-poverty areas, there are two factors associated with better outcomes for Black boys and smaller gaps: greater father presence and less racial discrimination.
- Neighborhoods have causal childhood exposure effects: Black boys who move to good areas at a younger age do better.

Racial composition over the life course: examining separate and unequal environments and the risk for heart disease for African American men

- Measured racial composition of several social environments across the life-course exposure in a sample of 118 African American men, recruited from a clinical site in St. Louis.
- Segregated neighborhoods and segregated occupations/workplaces increase risk for hypertension by 4x and 3x respectively.
- Study shows exposures to racial residential segregation and segregated workplaces become a cumulative risk to hypertension.
- Study shows low integration and exposure to opportunity in other time points of life (cumulative burden of discrimination).

Understanding health behaviors within segregated contexts

**Racial composition of neighborhoods (% black)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High</th>
<th>Low</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Middle-class black women</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Behavior: less physical activity</strong></td>
<td><strong>Behavior: more physical activity</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Economic disadvantage</td>
<td>- Less crime and more safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Less safety</td>
<td>- More facilities and green spaces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sexualization</td>
<td>- Social and economic advantage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Health care access and use</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Middle-class black men</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Behavior: more physical activity</strong></td>
<td><strong>Behavior: less physical activity</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- More comfortable</td>
<td>- More racial profiling/criminalization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sources of social support (bonding social capital)</td>
<td>- Social exclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Economic disadvantage</td>
<td>- Fewer sources of social support (restricted bonding and bridging social capital)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Principle**

**Conventional Approach**

**PHCRT Approach**

**Primacy of racialization**

Racial attributes become the contexts that lead to high crime and higher rates of police surveillance, and police violence.

**Race and Gender as social constructs**

Studies that understand the dominant feature to develop policies and policing practices and dismiss systemic discrimination.

From 1619 to 2020

- **Environmental Affordances:** Address the discriminatory and stressful social and economic living conditions, and restricted access to resources.

- **Life Course Perspective:** Understand and intervene across the life-course.

- **Intersectionality:** Address the intersections of race, gender, social class, place.

- **Critical Race Theory:** Explores racialization and its influence on the historical and current patterns of racial relations; social construction of knowledge and privileging voices of marginalized populations; identifying appropriate measures that capture social constructions of race.

- **Racial capitalism:** Connects racialized exploitation and capital accumulation as fundamental causes of health inequities.